

## IAS EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## **USING CAPE TO ESTIMATE FUTURE STOCK RETURNS**



Recent Wall Street research suggests the prospect of relatively low stock returns over the next decade (*e.g.*, 1%/y real return).<sup>1</sup> This is a significant reduction compared to the prior decade's realized real return of 10.5%/y. The prospect of low future returns stems from high stock market valuation as measured by CAPE (Shiller's S&P 500 cyclically adjusted P/E). Historically, high levels of CAPE are associated with relatively low long-term future stock returns.

However, using CAPE to generate future stock return estimates can produce significantly different forecasts depending on how CAPE is specified in the forecast model and whether there are other explanatory variables. While CAPE is viewed as an important predictor of future stock returns, there is little consensus on how to use CAPE for future return estimation.

We compare various CAPE models and identify that (1/CAPE - R)(*i.e.*, stock earnings yield - 10y US Treasury real yield) – also know as "stock excess yield" or the "Fed Model" – has delivered the best estimation performance (of those models considered), regardless of the level of CAPE.<sup>2</sup>

(1/CAPE - R) (i.e., stock earnings yield - 10y US Treasury real yield) has been - both theoretically and empirically - the best way to incorporate CAPE in estimating future 10y stock returns, especially when CAPE is high.

Historically, the recent reading of (1/CAPE - R) suggests a **4.6%/y** real return for stocks over the next decade (*vs.* 10.5%/y over the past decade), translating to a **6.6%-7.6%/y nominal return** assuming 2%-3%/y inflation.

## Estimate and 95% Prediction Interval of Future 10y Average Annual Stock Real Returns; as of August 2024



Source: Barclays, Datastream, Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis, FRED, Haver Analytics, Robert Shiller, S&P, US Treasury and PGIM IAS. Provided for illustrative purposes only.

Theoretically, stock returns would be expected to have a linear relationship with 1/CAPE – not CAPE or ln(CAPE) – suggesting that 1/CAPE might be the best empirical specification for "CAPE." However, we "let the data speak" and compare the **evolution of estimation accuracy** across different CAPE models **with an expanding window**.

We also consider adding 10y US Treasury *real* yields ("R") as an explanatory variable, along with CAPE, to account for the impact of *real* interest rates on future stock *real* returns.

Overall, 1/CAPE-based models (with and without the additional regressor, R) have generally outperformed others with lower estimation errors over time, while CAPE-based models have persistently *underestimated* future stock returns. Furthermore, 1/CAPE-based models are intuitively easier to interpret, as stock earnings yield (1/CAPE) – a "return" – directly relates to stock returns.

Among the models examined, (1/CAPE - R) has delivered the best forecast performance with the highest estimation accuracy (lowest average absolute estimation error). It has consistently topped other models since 2003.

## Estimation Error (Estimate – Actual; Out of Sample; %/y) of Future 10y Average Annual Stock Real Returns Based on An Expanding Window; Monthly, 3/1993 – 9/2014



Note: We run regressions and calculate estimation errors every month using data with an expanding window starting from April 1953 (when data become available) until that month, to avoid look-ahead bias. Regressions start in March 1993 (40y since April 1953) to allow for sufficient data to generate the first estimate. Source: Barclays, Datastream, Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis, FRED, Haver Analytics, Robert Shiller, S&P, US Treasury and PGIM IAS. Provided for illustrative purposes only.



Source: Barclays, Datastream, Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis, FRED, Haver Analytics, Robert Shiller, S&P, US Treasury and PGIM IAS. Provided for illustrative purposes only.

<sup>1</sup> See Updating Our Long-Term Return Forecast for US Equities to Incorporate the Current High Level of Market Concentration, Goldman Sachs, October 2024.

<sup>2</sup> See <u>Higher Bond Yields & the Fed Model – Implications for Future Stock-Bond Relative Returns</u>, PGIM IAS, November 2023

For Professional Investors Only.

Past performance is no guarantee or reliable indicator of future results. All investments involve risk, including the possible loss of capital. These materials are for informational or educational purposes only. In providing these materials, PGIM is not acting as your fiduciary.

Alternative investments are speculative, typically highly illiquid and include a high degree of risk. Investors could lose all or a substantial amount of their investment. Alternative investments are suitable only for long-term investors willing to forego liquidity and put capital at risk for an indefinite period of time. Equities may decline in value due to both real and perceived general market, economic and industry conditions. Investing in the bond market is subject to risks, including market, interest rate, issuer, credit, inflation risk and liquidity risk. Commodities contain heightened risk, including market, political, regulatory and natural conditions and may not be suitable for all investors. The use of models to evaluate securities markets based on certain assumptions concerning the interplay of market factors, may not adequately take into account certain factors and may result in a decline in the value of an investment, which could be substantial.

All charts contained herein were created as of the date of this presentation, unless otherwise noted. Performance results for certain charts and graphs may be limited by date ranges, as stated on the charts and graphs. Different time periods may produce different results. Charts and figures are provided for illustrative purposes and are not an indication of past or future performance of any PGIM product.

These materials represent the views, opinions and recommendations of the author(s) regarding the economic conditions, asset dasses, securities, issuers or financial instruments referenced herein, and are subject to change without notice. Certain information contained herein has been obtained from sources that PGIM believes to be reliable; however, PGIM cannot guarantee the accuracy of such information, assure its completeness, or warrant such information will not be changed. The information contained herein is current as of the date of issuance (or such earlier date as referenced herein) and is subject to change without notice. PGIM has no obligation to update any or all of such information; nor do we make any express or implied warranties or representations as to the completeness or accuracy or accept responsibility for errors. Any forecasts, estimates and certain information contained herein are based upon proprietary research and should not be considered as investment advice or a recommendation of any particular security, strategy or investment product. These materials are not intended as an offer or solicitation with respect to the purchase or sale of any security or other financial instrument or any investment management services and should not be used as the basis for any investment decision. No liability whatsoever is accepted for any loss (whether direct, indirect, or consequential) that may arise from any use of the information contained in or derived from this report. PGIM and is affiliates may make investment decisions that are inconsistent with the recommendations or views expressed herein, including for proprietary accounts of PGIM or its affiliates. The opinions and recommendations herein do not take into account individual client circumstances, objectives, or needs and are not intended as recommendations herein do not take into account individual client circumstances, No determination has been made regarding the suitability of any securities, financial instruments or strategies to particular clie

The information contained herein is provided by PGIM, Inc., the principal asset management business of Prudential Financial, Inc. (PFI), and an investment adviser registered with the US Securities and Exchange Commission. In the United Kingdom and various European Economic Area jurisdictions, information is issued by PGIM Limited with registered office: Grand Buildings, 1-3 Strand, Trafalgar Square, London, WC2N 5HR. PGIM Limited is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority of the United Kingdom (registration number 193418) and duly passported in various jurisdictions in the EEA. Prudential Financial, Inc. of the United States is not affiliated with Prudential plc, incorporated in the United Kingdom or with Prudential Assurance Company, a subsidiary of M&G plc, incorporated in the United Kingdom. These materials are issued by PGIM Limited to persons who are professional clients or eligible counterparties as defined in Directive 2014/65/EU (MiFID II), investing for their own account, for fund of funds, or discretionary clients. In certain countries in Asia, information is presented by PGIM (Singapore) Pte, Ltd., a Singapore investment manager registered with and licensed by the Monetary Authority of Singapore. In Japan, information is presented by PGIM Japan Co. Ltd., registered investment adviser with the Japanese Financial Services Agency. In South Korea, information is presented by PGIM, Inc., which is licensed to provide discretionary investment management services directly to South Korean investors. In Hong Kong, information is provided by PGIM (Hong Kong) Limited, a regulated entity with the Securities & Futures Commission in Hong Kong to professional investors as defined in Section 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 1 (paragraph (a) to (i) of the Securities and Futures Ordinance (Cap. 571). In Australia, this information is presented by PGIM (Australia) Pty Ltd. ("PGIM Australia") for the general information of its "wholesale" customers (as defined in the Corporations Act 2001). PGIM Australia is a representative of PGIM Limited, which is exempt from the requirement to hold an Australian Financial Services License under the Australian Corporations Act 2001 in respect of financial services. PGIM Limited is exempt by virtue of its regulation by the Financial Conduct Authority (Reg: 193418) under the laws of the United Kingdom and the application of ASIC Class Order 03/1099. The laws of the United Kingdom differ from Australian laws. Pursuant to the international adviser registration exemption in National Instrument 31-103, PGIM, Inc. is informing you of that: (1) PGIM, Inc. is not registered in Canada and relies upon an exemption from the adviser registration requirement under National Instrument 31-103; (2) PGIM, Inc.'s jurisdiction of residence is New Jersey, U.S.A.; (3) there may be difficulty enforcing legal rights against PGIM, Inc. because it is resident outside of Canada and all or substantially all of its assets may be situated outside of Canada; and (4) the name and address of the agent for service of process of PGIM, Inc. in the applicable Provinces of Canada are as follows: in Québec: Borden Ladner Gervais LLP, 1000 de La Gauchetière Street West, Suite 900 Montréal, QC H3B 5H4; in British Columbia: Borden Ladner Gervais LLP, 1200 Waterfront Centre, 200 Burrard Street, Vancouver, BC V7X 1T2; in Ontario: Borden Ladner Gervais LLP, 22 Adelaide Street West, Suite 3400, Toronto, ON M5H 4E3; in Nova Scotia: Cox & Palmer, Q.C., 1100 Purdy's Wharf Tower One, 1959 Upper Water Street, P.O. Box 2380 - Stn Central RPO, Halifax, NS B3J 3E5; in Alberta: Borden Ladner Gervais LLP, 530 Third Avenue S.W., Calgary, AB T2P R3

20250106-4134685